Functional analysis of *FRIGIDA* using naturally occurring variation in *Arabidopsis thaliana*

Lei Zhang^{1,2} and José M. Jiménez-Gómez^{1,3,*} (D)

¹Department of Plant Breeding and Genetics, Max Planck Institute for Plant Breeding Research, 50829 Cologne, German, ²Center for Applied Genetic Technologies, University of Georgia, 30605 Athens, GA, USA, and ³Institut Jean-Pierre Bourgin, INRAE, AgroParisTech, Université Paris-Saclay, 78000 Versailles, France

Received 5 October 2019; revised 16 January 2020; accepted 29 January 2020; published online 5 February 2020. *For correspondence (e-mail jose.jimenez-gomez@inra.fr).

SUMMARY

The FRIGIDA locus (FRI, AT4G00650) has been extensively studied in Arabidopsis thaliana because of its role creating flowering time diversity. The FRI protein regulates flowering induction by binding partner proteins on its N-terminus and C-terminus domains and creating a supercomplex that promotes transcription of the floral repressor FLOWERING LOCUS C (FLC). Despite the knowledge accumulated on FRIGIDA (FRI), the function of the highly conserved central domain of the protein is still unknown. Functional characterization of naturally occurring DNA polymorphisms can provide useful information about the role of a protein and the localization of its operative domains. For FRI, loss-of-function mutations are positively selected and widespread in nature, making them a powerful tool to study the function of the different domains of the protein. Here we explore natural sequence variation in the FRI locus in more than 1000 Arabidopsis accessions. We identify 127 mutations that alter the FRI protein, including 60 that had never been described before. We defined 103 different alleles of FRI and study their association with variation in flowering time. We confirmed these associations by cloning 22 different alleles and expressing them in a common null genetic background. Our analysis pinpoints two single amino acid changes in the central domain that render the protein non-functional. We show that these two mutations determine the stability and cellular localization of the FRI protein. In summary, our work makes use of natural variants at the FRI locus to help understanding the function of the central domain of the FRI protein.

Keywords: Arabidopsis thaliana, FRIGIDA, natural variation, polymorphisms, vernalization, flowering time.

INTRODUCTION

One of the best studied environmental responses in *Arabidopsis thaliana* is the capacity to accelerate floral transition in response to a prolonged exposure to cold, called vernalization (Bloomer and Dean, 2017). In Arabidopsis there is natural variation for the vernalization requirement, with most accessions presenting late flowering unless vernalized, and others, such as the common laboratory strains Col-0 and Ler, flowering early even in the absence of a cold treatment (Pigliucci *et al.*, 2003; Koornneef *et al.*, 2004). The requirement for vernalization depends in a large part on natural genetic variation at two flowering time genes: *FRIGIDA (FRI)* and *FLOWERING LOCUS C (FLC)*, with late flowering accessions typically carrying functional alleles of both genes (Michaels and Amasino, 1999; Johanson *et al.*, 2000).

FLC is a central floral repressor; it encodes a MADS-box transcription factor that acts as a potent transcriptional

repressor of floral inducers such as FLOWERING LOCUS T (FT) and SUPPRESSOR OF CONSTANS 1 (SOC1) (Michaels and Amasino, 1999; Amasino, 2010). Vernalization leads to histone modification and stable epigenetic silencing at the FLC locus; therefore enabling the plants to flower even upon returning to the warmth (De Lucia et al., 2008; Angel et al., 2011; Heo and Sung, 2011). The coding sequence of FLC is highly conserved among Arabidopsis accessions (Li et al., 2014). Null alleles of FLC due to protein truncation or expression suppression have been reported but are rare (Werner et al., 2005). Most polymorphisms in the FLC locus are present in non-coding sequences and are associated with different vernalization requirements in terms of duration and temperature (Li et al., 2014). Nevertheless, the effect of variation in FLC can only be observed in the presence of a functional allele of FRI (Caicedo et al., 2004).

FRI plays an essential role to re-set the expression level of *FLC* during embryogenesis via chromatin modification;

© 2020 The Authors.

ensuring that every generation of newly germinated seedlings requires vernalization to flower despite coming from previously vernalized parents (Sheldon et al., 2008; Choi et al., 2009). The FRI protein acts as a scaffold to form a transcription activation complex by interaction with FRI-GIDA LIKE 1 (FRL1) at the N-terminal, and SUPPRESSOR OF FRIGIDA 4 (SUF4), FRIGIDA ESSENTIAL 1 (FES1) and FLC EXPRESSOR (FLX) at the C-terminal (Choi et al., 2011). The FRI complex interacts with the H3K4 methyltransferase complex COMPASS-like, HISTONE ACETYLTRANSFERASE OF THE MYST FAMLIY1 (HAM1), SWR1 chromatin remodelling complex (SWR1-C), ubiquitin-conjugating enzyme 1 (UBC1) that promotes H2B monoubiguitination and the cap binding complex that binds to 5' cap of nascent premRNAs (Li et al., 2018). This FRI-containing supercomplex modifies chromatin structure and promotes formation of the FLC 5' to 3' gene loop, establishing a local chromosomal environment that promotes FLC mRNA transcriptional activation and fast elongation (Li et al., 2018). The FRI transcript can be first detected during embryogenesis and continues to be present in all tissues throughout the lifetime of Arabidopsis. This is also true for the FRI protein, although the protein is degraded during cold treatment; suggesting that FRI also plays a role in the downregulation of FLC during vernalization (Hu et al., 2014). FRI encodes a 609 amino acid protein and it is the founding member of the FRIGIDA family, which comprises seven members in Arabidopsis and is characterized by a conserved central region (Risk et al., 2010). Attempts at structural analysis of the FRI protein found that only the central region is soluble (Risk et al., 2010). In grape, the crystal structure of the central region of FRI reveals 14 α -helices linked by loops or short one-turn α -helices (Hyun *et al.*, 2016). Despite its high degree of conservation, the specific function of the central domain of FRI remains largely unknown.

Extensive nucleotide diversity has been reported at the FRI locus among Arabidopsis accessions from a wide range of latitudes (Hagenblad et al., 2004; Lempe et al., 2005; Shindo et al., 2005) or narrower local collections (Le Corre et al., 2002; Méndez-Vigo et al., 2011). Comparison of the FRI protein sequence from Arabidopsis and its closely related species A. lyrata reveals that the ancestral allele of FRI is the one found in the accession H51 (FRI-H51) (Le Corre et al., 2002). FRI-H51 encodes a fully functional FRI protein that is able to induce FLC expression, thus delaying flowering in the absence of vernalization (Johanson et al., 2000). Most accessions that do not require vernalization to induce flowering carry non-functional alleles of FRI, which typically contain loss-of-function mutations such as premature stop codons or large deletions. The two most widespread FRI alleles in early flowering accessions are found in the common laboratory strain Columbia (Col-0) and Landsberg erecta (Ler). FRI-Col contains a 16-bp deletion, which causes a premature stop codon after 314 amino

Functional analysis of FRIGIDA natural variation 155

acids, hampering the function of the protein (Johanson et al., 2000). FRI-Ler contains a 376-bp deletion combined with a 31-bp insertion in the promoter region that removes its translational start and greatly reduces the expression of a truncated transcript lacking 42 amino acids in the N-terminal domain (Schmalenbach et al., 2014). Despite this truncation, the FRI-Ler protein is able to upregulate the expression of FLC and delay flowering when expressed at wild-type levels (Schmalenbach et al., 2014). Accessions carrying point amino acid mutations relative to the FRI-H51 allele, especially in the first exon, are widespread in nature; and some of these wild alleles have been shown to confer the vernalization requirement (Gazzani et al., 2003). Because of this, it has been generally accepted that truncated alleles of FRI are non-functional, while alleles encoding full-length protein are functional regardless of the presence of point mutations (Lempe et al., 2005; Shindo et al., 2005; Werner et al., 2005).

In this work, we analyzed sequence variation in the *FRI* gene in 1135 Arabidopsis accessions for which re-sequencing data are available (1001 Genomes Consortium, 2016). We define 103 different alleles of FRI and select 22 alleles based on flowering time differences between accessions. We then perform heterologous expression of the selected alleles in a common genetic background and identify two loss-of-function mutations in the central domain of the protein. Finally, we show that these mutations determine the stability and cellular localization of the FRI protein, providing clues to the function of the central domain of this protein.

RESULTS

Sequence variation in the *FRI* gene in natural populations of Arabidopsis

We explored allele diversity at the FRI locus using whole genome sequencing data available for 1135 Arabidopsis accessions (1001 Genomes Consortium, 2016). Short reads from all accessions were aligned to a modified Col-0 reference genome in which the non-functional FRI-Col-0 allele was substituted by the functional FRI-H51 allele (Johanson et al., 2000). We then called variants in the FRI gene from the aligned reads. Accessions that presented low coverage and/or heterozygous variants were filtered out, leaving us with 1016 accessions for our analyses. After several rounds of manual curation to discard artefacts, we detected 171 mutations (147 SNPs + 24 indels) (Table S1). The exact sequence for five large indels could not be obtained using only short read alignments, and was annotated from de novo assemblies of the affected accessions. We annotated all variants with their effect on the FRI protein, resulting in 127 non-synonymous variants. This doubles the number of non-synonymous variants observed in previous works (Le Corre et al., 2002; Gazzani et al., 2003; Werner et al., 2005;

© 2020 The Authors. The Plant Journal published by Society for Experimental Biology and John Wiley & Sons Ltd,

The Plant Journal, (2020), 103, 154–165



Figure 1. Allelic diversity at the FRI locus in Arabidopsis. Only the 40 most frequent FRI alleles are included. The complete set of alleles can be found in Figure S2.

(a) Maximum likelihood tree for the most frequent alleles found. The H51 allele (a001) was used as the root. Asterisks to the right of the names indicate alleles selected for functional characterization in this work.

(b) Graphical representation of sequence differences between each allele and the a001 allele. Background colour represents putatively functional (grey) and nonfunctional (red) alleles. Black open circles represent non-synonymous single nucleotide polymorphisms (SNPs). Rectangles and triangles represent deletions and insertions, respectively, and the numbers inside indicate their length in bp. Blue symbols indicate non-frameshift indels. Red symbols indicate frameshift indels or stop codon gain/losses, all of which are considered to putatively disrupt the function of the protein.

(c) Number of accessions (in log₂ scale) carrying each allele. Alleles carrying putative loss-of-function mutations are coloured in red.

(d) Average flowering time \pm standard error of the mean of all accessions carrying each allele. Flowering time data were obtained from the Arabidopsis 1001 genomes project as days to the opening of the first flower in plants grown in long days at 16°C (FT16). Alleles carrying putative loss-of-function mutations are indicated in red.

Shindo et al., 2005; Méndez-Vigo et al., 2011), although it misses 16 of the variants already described (Table S2). Among all variants found, 26 were labelled as inducing loss-of-function alleles: 4 large indels, 14 frameshift indels, 7 premature stop codons, and 1 deletion of the stop codon. These variants included the deletion of the start codon present in the FRI-Ler allele (Schmalenbach et al., 2014) and the frameshift deletion that defines the FRI-Col-0 allele (Johanson et al., 2000). Measures of selection using these polymorphisms confirmed previous reports of positive selection on the FRI gene and population expansion in Arabidopsis (ds/dn = 3.98, Tajima's D = -2.12) (Johanson et al., 2000; Le Corre et al., 2002; Le Corre, 2005; Toomajian et al., 2006). Interestingly, non-synonymous changes and indels accumulated preferentially outside the central region of the gene (Figure S1), suggesting an essential role of this conserved part of the protein (Risk et al., 2010).

We defined 103 distinct FRI alleles based only on nonsynonymous changes (Figures 1 and S2 and Table S3). The majority of accessions (61.8%) carried one of six alleles, including the H51 allele (a001), the non-functional alleles present in the accessions Ler (a062) and Col-0 (a044) or another three functional alleles (a043, a009, and a100). Putatively loss-of-function mutations were present in 31 alleles distributed among 245 accessions. We found 48 accessions carrying alleles not present in any other accession. We used the published classification of accession in nine STRUCTURE groups based on their genome-wide genotypes to explore the frequencies of FRI alleles across the globe (Table S3) (1001 Genomes Consortium, 2016). As expected, each of the genetically distinct groups presented a different allelic profile for FRI, with one or two alleles being very common in each group (Figure 2). Non-functional alleles were overrepresented among accessions from Central Europe, Germany, and Western Europe; but underrepresented in all other groups (P < 0.01 in Fisher's exact test, Figure S3). Indeed, most central European accessions carry the FRI-Ler allele (a062); most German accessions carry either one of two alleles that are identical except for the 16-bp frameshift deletion characteristic of the Col-0 allele (a043 and a044); and western European accessions carry a variety of non-functional alleles, including some only found in Western Europe (i.e. a003, a041, and a019). Interestingly, the only relict accession that contained a non-functional allele of FRI was Cvi-0, the southern-most accession in the set, which carries an allele with a premature stop codon that is private to this accession (a021, Figures 2 and S2 and Table S1).

We studied the effect of the loss-of-function mutations in the activity of the protein by analyzing previously Figure 2. FRI allele frequency and distribution among Arabidopsis populations. The number of accessions carrying individual FRI allele in each STRUCTURE group indicated in 1001 Genomes Consortium (2016) is represented in circular bar plots. Allele names are as in Figure 1. Names from low frequency alleles in groups with more than 25 alleles have been removed, and can be found in Table S3. Bars representing putatively non-functional alleles are coloured in red.



reported flowering time in natural accessions (1001 Genomes Consortium, 2016). On average, accessions carrying loss-of-function mutations in FRI flowered significantly earlier than accessions with putatively functional alleles (Figure S4a, P < 2e-16 in ANOVA). As observed previously (Stinchcombe *et al.*, 2004), flowering time from accessions with functional alleles of FRI strongly correlated with latitude, but this correlation disappears in accessions carrying non-functional FRI alleles (Figure S4b). We then studied flowering time variation among accessions grouped by their FRI allele, considering only those alleles sufficiently represented in the population (alleles containing loss-of-

function mutations accelerated flowering with respect to alleles labelled as functional. Interestingly, alleles a016, a060, and a089 were associated with early flowering despite lacking loss-of-function polymorphisms (Figure 1). These three alleles, together with another 19 alleles selected to maximize sequence variation at the FRI locus, were used to confirm our predictions on the effect of natural polymorphisms in the function of the FRI protein.

Functional analysis of natural FRI alleles

We cloned and sequenced a region spanning positions -1372 bp to +2691 bp from the start codon from 22 different alleles of the *FRI* locus (Figure 3a and Data S1).

Figure 3. Flowering time of transgenic lines carrying selected alleles of FRI.

(a) Schematic representation of selected FRI proteins including mutations relative to the FRI-Bil-7 allele.

(b) Flowering time of T_1 transgenic lines carrying the FRI alleles shown in (a). All plants were grown under long day conditions. Error bars represent the standard error of the mean. The number in each bar indicates the number of plants analyzed per line. Letters on top of each bar represent significance groups as determined by the Tukey honest significant difference (HSD) test.



© 2020 The Authors. The Plant Journal published by Society for Experimental Biology and John Wiley & Sons Ltd, The Plant Journal, (2020), **103**, 154–165





(a) Flowering time of homozygous T_3 lines carrying single insertions of the FRI-Bå1-2, FRI-Wa-1, or FRI-Bil-7 transgenes in comparison with untransformed Col-0. All plants were grown in the greenhouse under long day conditions. The number in each bar indicates the number of individual plants analyzed. (b, c) Relative expression of FRI (B) and FLC (c) in the transgenic lines shown in (a). The aerial part from 10-day-old seedlings grown in long day conditions was

pooled for each replicate, and three biological replicates were used for each line. Expression was normalized to the expression of PP2a and compared with Col-0 using the Tukey HSD test (*P < 0.05; ***P < 0.001). In all cases, error bars represent the standard error of the mean.

One of the accessions used, Alc-0, carried an allele with a premature termination codon that was not found in the re-sequenced accessions (Figure 1). Sequence analysis of the promoters of all chosen alleles revealed frequent single nucleotide polymorphisms (SNPs) and small deletions of one to three nucleotides, and a major deletion in the St-0 allele (from -540 to -470 bp), where no known regulator motif had been described (Data S2 and Figure S5).

We studied the functionality of these alleles by measuring flowering time in transgenic lines expressing each allele from its native promoter. To enable comparison, all constructs were transformed onto a wild-type Col-0 background that carried a null allele of FRI and a functional allele of FLC (Schmalenbach et al., 2014). We measured flowering time as total leaf number at the day of the opening of the first flower in the T₁ generation. All lines carrying FRI alleles encoding C-terminal truncated proteins flowered at the same time as Col-0 control plants (Figure 3b). The longest C-terminal truncated allele was that from the accession NFA-10 (a019) that only lacked 115 amino acids, suggesting that essential amino acids for the function of FRI are located beyond amino acid 494. Interestingly, lines carrying the N-terminal truncated FRI-Ren-1 allele flowered significantly later than the control (21.8 \pm 1.6 in *FRI-Ren-1* compared with 14.0 \pm 0.2 in CoI-0, P < 0.001 in *t*-test between the two groups). This is reminiscent of the slight but significant flowering time delay observed with the FRI-Ler allele, in which a deletion overlapping the promoter and start codon of the FRI gene caused expression at low levels of a functional FRI protein lacking the first 42 amino acids (Schmalenbach et al., 2014). It is therefore likely that the large deletion present in the promoter and N-terminal domain of the FRI-Ren-1

allele, although different from the one found in *FRI-Ler*, has a similar consequence (Figures 3a and S5).

Most FRI alleles encoding full-length proteins significantly delayed flowering when introduced into a Col-0 background (Figure 3b). Interestingly, from the three putatively functional alleles that were selected because their association with early flowering in Figure 1, the FRI-Van-0 (a060) allele delayed flowering time in the transgenic lines, indicating that this allele is functional and that the accessions that carry it may contain mutations in additional flowering time genes or in unsampled regulatory regions. By contrast, non-functional alleles of FRI were confirmed in lines carrying the FRI-Bå1-2 (a089) and FRI-Wa-1 (a016) alleles, which did not flower significantly differently from Col-0 (15.1 \pm 0.2 and 15.8 \pm 0.6 total leaves in the FRI-Bå1-2 and FRI-Wa-1 lines, respectively, versus 14.0 \pm 0.2 in Col-0). In order to better understand the causes for this lack of functionality of the FRI locus, we further investigated the mutations in the FRI-Bå1-2 and FRI-Wa-1 alleles.

Non-synonymous polymorphisms disrupt *FRI-Bå1-2* and *FRI-Wa-1*

We first confirmed the lack of function in the *FRI-Bå1-2* and *FRI-Wa-1* alleles in independent T_3 families that were homozygous for a single copy of the transgene. As observed in the T_1 generation, T_3 lines carrying the *FRI-Bå1-2* and *FRI-Wa-1* alleles flowered with a similar leaf number as Col-0 plants, while lines carrying the *FRI-Bil-7* allele flowered with a significantly increased number of leaves (Figure 4a). One possibility is that early flowering in the *FRI-Bå1-2* and *FRI-Wa-1* transgenic lines is caused by low expression of these alleles triggered by the various mutations found in their regulatory regions (Data S2 and



Figure 5. Characterization of amino acid mutations in FRI-Bå1-2 protein.

(a) Flowering time of T₁ transgenic plants and Col-0 control. All transgenic plants were selected on Murashige and Skoog (MS) agar medium containing kanamycin for 7 days; Col-0 plants were grown on MS agar medium without kanamycin. All plants were transplanted to soil and grown under long day conditions in the greenhouse. Numbers inside each bar indicate the number of individual plants analyzed in each line; letters on top of the box represent the significance groups as determined by Tukey honest significant difference (HSD) test.

(b) Confocal images of root tips of 7-day-old seedlings. The root was treated with propidium iodide, which outlined the cells in red. GFP signals from the FRI proteins could only be observed in the cytoplasm or nuclei of transgenic lines but not in the Col-0 plants. One representative image from each genotype is shown.

Figure S5). However, all lines showed either slightly higher or significantly elevated *FRI* transcription levels in comparison with the control Col-0 plants (Figure 4b), suggesting that the early flowering phenotype of the transgenic lines carrying the *FRI-Bå1-2* and *FRI-Wa-1* alleles is likely to be caused by coding differences. If that was the case, these alleles, albeit normally expressed, should fail to increase the expression of its main target *FLC*. Indeed, in contrast with the *FRI-Bil-7* allele, the *FRI-Bå1-2* and *FRI-Wa-1* alleles did not significantly upregulate the expression of *FLC* (Figure 4c). These results suggested that the aborted functionality of the *FRI-Bå1-2* and *FRI-Wa-1* alleles is due to coding polymorphisms that render the proteins non-functional.

In terms of their non-synonymous mutations, both the FRI-Bå1-2, and FRI-Wa-1 protein carry amino acid changes in the central domain of the FRI protein, whose function has not been characterized in depth, despite being highly conserved in the Brassicaceae family (Figure S6). The two mutations present in the FRI-Bå1-2 protein (L276R and E302G) resulted in dramatic changes in the chemical properties of the residues. The hydrophobic leucine is replaced by the negatively charged glutamic acid and the positively charged arginine is replaced by the hydrophobic glycine. The mutation in the central domain of FRI-Wa-1 (L294F), replaces the leucine in Bil-7 by a much bulkier phenylalanine. The FRI-Wa-1 allele also carries two amino acid mutations in the N-terminal domain, although these are also present in the functional FRI-Zdr-6 and FRI-Spr1-6 alleles and they are not likely to affect FRI function (Figure 3). In summary, the amino acid changes found in the central domain of the FRI-Bå1-2 and FRI-Wa-1 proteins could potentially compromise their function and provide clues to the role of this domain in the FRI protein.

Amino acid mutation L276R prevents the nuclear localization of FRI

We studied the effect of the two mutations present in the FRI-Bå1-2 allele on protein function. To do this, we obtained green fluorescent protein (GFP)-tagged versions of the FRI-Bil-7 and FRI-Bå1-2 alleles (FRI-Bil-7-GFP and FRI-Bå1-2-GFP) under the control of their respective native promoter, and performed directed mutagenesis on the FRI-Bil-7-GFP allele to include the individual L276R or E302G mutations (FRI-L276R-GFP and FRI-E302G-GFP). We scored flowering time as total leaf number in the T₁ generation from Col-0 plants transformed with these constructs (Figure 5a). Lines carrying the functional FRI-Bil-7-GFP transgene flowered significantly later than Col-0 plants and lines transformed with the FRI-Bå1-2-GFP allele, indicating that the GFP tag does not interfere with the function of the FRI protein. Among the individual mutations, the lines carrying the FRI-E302G-GFP construct flowered significantly later than Col-0, while those carrying the FRI-L276R-GFP allele did not. This result suggests that the L276R mutation present in the FRI-Bå1-2 protein is sufficient to prevent its normal function.

We characterized the effect of the L276R mutation on FRI by studying its cellular localization in root tip cells, where wild-type FRI accumulates in the nuclei (Kim *et al.*, 2006). The nuclear localization of FRI is essential to its function because the FRI complex delays flowering by causing chromatin modification at the *FLC* locus (Choi *et al.*, 2011; Li *et al.*, 2018). While a strong GFP signal could be observed in the nuclei of the root tip cells in late flowering lines (*FRI-E302G–GFP* and *FRI-Bil-7–GFP*, Figure 5b), the FRI-Bå1-2–GFP, and FRI-L276R–GFP

© 2020 The Authors.

The Plant Journal published by Society for Experimental Biology and John Wiley & Sons Ltd, *The Plant Journal*, (2020), **103**, 154–165



Figure 6. Characterization of L294F amino acid mutation in FRI protein.

(a) Flowering time expressed as total leaf number from homozygous T_3 transgenic lines carrying FRI-L294F–GFP or FRI-Bil-7–GFP. All plants were grown under long day conditions in a greenhouse. The number in each bar indicates the number of plants per line analyzed. Flowering time in each line was compared to Col-0 (**, P < 0.05, ***, P < 0.001).

(b) Expression of FRI in the same genotypes shown in (a). Aerial part was pooled from 10-day-old seedlings grown in long day conditions. Three biological replicates were used per genotype. Expression was normalized to the expression of PP2a and compared with Col-0 (***, P < 0.001).

(c) Confocal images of root tips of 1-week-old seedlings grown on MS agar medium under long day condition. One representative image from each line is shown.

(d) Western blot detection of FRI protein using anti-GFP antibodies. Seedlings from the same experiment shown in (c) were pooled for protein extraction. The numbers represent the intensity of the bands.

proteins were observed only in the cytoplasm, suggesting that the L276R mutation in the FRI-Bå1-2 allele affects its ability to enter the nucleus.

Amino acid mutation L294F disrupts the stability of FRI

To study the effect of the L294F mutation in FRI, we created an artificial FRI-L294F-GFP allele by introducing the mutation in the FRI-Bil-7-GFP construct; which was then transformed into Col-0 plants. Consistent with previous results, T₃ lines carrying the FRI-L294F-GFP construct flowered early, despite presenting a high expression of the transgene; while lines carrying the FRI-Bil-7-GFP allele showed both significantly high expression of FRI and late flowering (Figure 6a,b). We then studied the localization of both alleles in root tip cells. In contrast with the strong nuclear localized GFP signal in the plants transformed with FRI-Bil-7-GFP, we observed no GFP signal in two of the FRI-L294F-GFP transgenic lines, and only a weak cytoplasmic GFP signal in the third line (Figure 6c). Western blot results using the same plant material agreed with the differences in protein abundance observed under the microscope (Figure 6d). The low accumulation of FRI protein with the L294F mutation suggests that this single amino acid mutation causes instability and degradation of the FRI protein and thus abolishes its function.

DISCUSSION

The analysis of natural variation in flowering time in Arabidopsis focused on the FRI gene from a very early stage, because of its major contribution to this trait (Burn et al., 1993; Lee et al., 1993; Clarke and Dean, 1994). Since its identification (Johanson et al., 2000), multiple studies have surveyed sequence variation at the FRI gene in Arabidopsis (Le Corre et al., 2002; Gazzani et al., 2003; Hagenblad et al., 2004; Shindo et al., 2005; Schmalenbach et al., 2014). With the appearance of short read sequencing, it has become possible to investigate the alleles present in hundreds of individuals with reasonable amounts of time and funds, although obtaining an accurate representation of the mutations in a locus still remains challenging. Unsupervised mutation mining in the FRI locus with 1135 re-sequenced Arabidopsis accessions resulted in the identification of 307 variants, with more than one third of them being artefacts that appear from the alignment of short reads to the borders of large indels or rearrangements. After manual curation of variants and de novo assembly of structural variants, we defined 171 naturally occurring mutations in 1016 accessions, including 26 loss-of-function mutations. As expected, the geographical distribution of these variants was not random, and accessions carrying non-functional FRI alleles were underrepresented among southern and northern European accessions but enriched in central and western European accessions (Figure 2). When particular mutations can be associated to phenotypic differences in the plants that carry them, they provide an opportunity to investigate the role of the different parts of the protein. In this study, we selected 22 alleles carrying a diversity of mutations with the aim to shed light on the function of the different domains of the protein.

All alleles studied functionally, except FRI-Bå1-2, carried mutations in the N-terminal region. This region has been proposed to be under strong selection to generate adaptively significant flowering time variation (Le Corre et al., 2002; Shindo et al., 2005), and it is known to interact with FRL1, which is required for FRI-mediated upregulation of FLC (Choi et al., 2011). In our study, we did not observe significantly different ds/dn ratios for the N-terminal region when compared with the central domain or the C-terminal region, and none of the non-synonymous polymorphisms tested in this region compromised the function of the protein. However, we observed variation in flowering time among the late flowering transgenic lines. It is therefore possible that amino acid substitutions in the N-terminal domain generate subtle differences in protein function that may not be detectable in our study despite our efforts of using large number of independent T_1 lines to minimize the variation due to transgene insertion position and number. Experiments with better control on the dosage of the transgene or using introgression lines would be better suited to evaluate subtle effects of amino acid substitutions in the N-terminal domain of FRI. One of the studied alleles. FRI-Ren-1, presents a partial deletion of the N-terminal domain, presumably forcing translation from a second inframe start codon at position +127, as it has been described for the FRI-Ler allele (Schmalenbach et al., 2014). We have previously shown that the deletion of the first 42 amino acids in FRI-Ler does not affect flowering time, and accessions carrying the Ler-FRI allele show an intermediate flowering phenotype caused by the low expression of the allele due to the deletion in its promoter (Schmalenbach et al., 2014). In this work, we hypothesize a similar situation for the FRI-Ren-1 allele, based on the intermediate flowering time of the transgenic lines expressing this allele (Figure 3). Interestingly, a previous study showed that deletion of the first 50 amino acids in the N-terminal domain of FRI is sufficient to disrupt binding to FRL1 in a yeast-twohybrid system (Choi et al., 2011). The functionality of the FRI-Ren-1 and FRI-Ler alleles suggests that the functional positions in the N-terminal of the FRI protein are located between amino acids 42 and 50. Further work will be needed to explore this hypothesis.

In our study, all alleles presenting truncations in the C-terminal domain appear to be non-functional as they were unable to delay flowering time when compared with Col-0, a *fri* null mutant (Figure 3). A previous study had

Functional analysis of FRIGIDA natural variation 161

shown that a truncated FRI protein lacking the last 151 amino acids from the C-terminal domain failed to delay flowering time when expressed in Col-0 (Risk *et al.*, 2010). In fact, Y2H analysis shows that the 150 C-terminal amino acids physically interact with components of the FRI complex such as FLX, SUF4, and FES1 (Choi *et al.*, 2011). In our study, *FRI-NFA-10* encodes a FRI protein with a C-terminal deletion including the last 115 amino acids (Figure 3). Therefore, the lack of functionality of this allele allows us to redefine the functional domain of the C-terminal region in FRI to its last 115 amino acids.

Despite its conservation across Brassicaceae (Figure S6), the function of the central domain of FRI has remained elusive. We have identified two non-synonymous mutations in FRI-Bå1-2 and FRI-Wa-1 that disrupt the function of the protein. The single mutation from leucine to arginine at residue 276 in FRI-Bå1-2 prevents the nuclear localization of the FRI protein (Figure 5). We identified five nuclear localization signals (NLS) in the FRI sequence based on the prediction of three bioinformatics tools (Nair et al., 2003; King and Guda, 2007; Sperschneider et al., 2017), but residue 276 is not in the vicinity of any of these NLSs (Figure S7). A recent study hypothesized that the leucine 276 is tightly surrounded by other hydrophobic residues, therefore a mutation to the positively charged arginine may disrupt the core structure of FRI and indirectly affect its ability to enter the nucleus (Hyun et al., 2016). We believe that our study confirms this hypothesis. However, the same study predicted that the mutation at position 302 from positively charged glutamate to glycine would disrupt the protein structure, which we have not been able to confirm through functional studies of the E302G mutation (Figure 5). Interestingly, another mutation at position 294 abolishes the function of FRI in a different fashion. The change from leucine to a bulky hydrophilic phenylalanine in the tightly folded core of the protein may disrupt its folding and cause its degradation, as indicated by its very low accumulation (Figure 6).

In terms of their origin, the L294F mutation is present in six accessions, Wa-1, Wil-1, Wil-2, Litva, Tottarp-2, and Est (Table S1). Although these accessions are distributed along central Europe and south Sweden, all of them have a clear central European ancestry (Figure S8 and Table S3), suggesting a central European origin. The mutation L276R is present in three accessions, Bå1-2, Bå4-1, and Bå5-1, all originally from a single location in Southern Sweden (Figure S8 and Tables S1 and S3), which suggest a recent appearance of the a086 allele and contrasts with the low abundance of non-functional alleles among southern Swedish accessions (Figure 2). Although speculative, it is possible that this recent appearance of accessions that do not need vernalization at such high latitudes could be due to the increase in mean temperatures associated to global warming.

© 2020 The Authors. The Plant Journal published by Society for Experimental Biology and John Wiley & Sons Ltd,

The Plant Journal, (2020), 103, 154-165

In summary, we have surveyed natural variation in the coding sequence of FRI using data from more than 1000 Arabidopsis accessions, allowing us to define the distribution of non-functional alleles in this species and identifying novel variants that can shed light on the function of the protein. According to our results, the central domain of FRI would be implicated both in the stability and nuclear localization of the protein.

EXPERIMENTAL PROCEDURES

Analysis of short reads from 1135 Arabidopsis accessions

We constructed a modified Arabidopsis reference genome by substituting the Col-0 FRI allele in the TAIR10 reference sequence by the functional H51 allele and modifying accordingly the available annotation. Short reads for 1135 Arabidopsis accessions (1001 Genomes Consortium, 2016) were downloaded from SRA (SRP056687) and aligned to the modified reference genome using BOWTIE 2 version 2.3.4.2 with default parameters (Langmead and Salzberg, 2012). Previous to variant calling, reads with mapping quality lower than 5 were discarded using SAMTOOLS v1.7 (Li et al., 2009), duplicated reads were removed using PICARDTOOLS (http:// broadinstitute.github.io/picard) and indels were realigned using GATK INDELREALIGNER (McKenna et al., 2010). Finally, variants on the FRI gene were called simultaneously in all alignments with GATK UNIFIEDGENOTYPER (McKenna et al., 2010). Polymorphisms in the FRI gene were manually curated using the IGV genome browser (Robinson et al., 2011) to remove artefacts due to low coverage or low quality alignments around large indels. In addition, we removed 111 accessions that presented an average coverage over the FRI gene lower than 10, and eight accessions that presented more than one heterozygous variant. We identified five large indels for which the precise sequence could not be determined from the short read alignments. The sequence of these indels was obtained from de novo assemblies of the affected accessions (id: 108, 139, 1070, 5236, 6090, 6390, 7427, 8240, 9121 and 9726) using SPAdes with k-mer size set to 33, 55, 77, and 99, and otherwise default parameters (Bankevich et al., 2012). The resulting de novo assembled contigs were screened for the presence of the FRI gene using BLAST v2.6.0+ (Camacho et al., 2009) and the FRI genomic sequence from the H51 accession. The indel sequence was extracted from the alignment of the positive contigs against the H51 genomic sequence using MUSCLE v3.8.31 (Edgar, 2004). The effect of each polymorphism on the FRI protein was annotated with ANNOVAR (Wang et al., 2010).

The matrix containing 171 polymorphisms and their presence/ absence in all 1016 accessions analyzed was used to generate *in silico* FRI alleles, giving rise to 130 distinct FRI CDS. In order to calculate ds/dn and the average behaviour of each codon, we constructed codon alignments of the 1016 alleles by excluding insertions. Average ds/dn value between all alleles and the H51 reference as well as the cumulative codon behaviour for indels, non-synonymous and synonymous variants were calculated using SNAP (http://www.hiv.lanl.gov). In this software, ds and dn are calculated as the proportion of observed synonymous and non-synonymous substitutions in the alignments, corrected for multiple hits using the Jukes–Cantor method. Tajima's D was calculated for the complete region of the *FRI* gene using vcFTOOLS v0.1.15 (Danecek *et al.*, 2011).

Flowering time (from plants grown in long days at 16°C) and STRUCTURE group membership for each accession was obtained

from the 1001 genomes project (1001 Genomes Consortium, 2016) (http://1001genomes.org/tables/1001genomes-FT10-FT16_and_ 1001genomes-accessions.html).

Cloning of FRIGIDA alleles

The *FRI* locus in all accessions analyzed was amplified using Phusion High-Fidelity DNA polymerase using primer FRI-clonF (at position –1552, GGAAGCAAATGACCGTAAAATC) and FRI-clonR (position +2946, TCTCAGTGCTGTATAACTACA). The PCR product was digested with *Bam*HI and *Eco*RI, whose restriction sites are at –1372 and +2691, respectively, relative to the annotated start codon of *FRI* in TAIR10. After digestion, the reaction was run in an agarose gel and the expected size band was purified using Gel Extraction Kits (QIAGEN, http://www.qiagen.com). All the purified *FRI* fragments were introduced into pBinDsRed (kindly provided by Ed Cahoon, University of Nebraska) making use of the *Bam*HI and *Eco*RI restriction sites.

The FRI-GFP fusion protein was generated making use of binary vector pGWB404 (Nakagawa et al., 2007) that contains an in-frame GFP tag downstream of the Gateway recombination site. To do this, the FRI promoter and coding sequence up to the stop codon (-1372 to +2293) was amplified from the genomic DNA of the accession Bil-7 using the following primers where the AttB sequence for Gateway cloning is marked in parenthesis: FRI-gwF (position -1372) (GGGGACAAGTTTGTACAAAAAGCAGGCTTA) GATCCCAAAATCTAGTGCCGCCG and FRI-gwR (position +2293) (GGGGACCACTTTGTACAAGAAAGCTGGGTT) TTTGGGGTCTAAT-GATGAGTTACTGC. Mutations L276R, L294F, or E302G were introduced to the amplified DNA fragment of the FRI-Bil-7 allele by site directed mutagenesis, as described in (Ho et al., 1989), using the following overlapping primers where the mutated nucleotides to introduce the amino acid changes are in parentheses: mutL276R-F (position +816) TTGCTTTTAC(G)AGTTGCTTGTTTTG and mutL276R-R (position +838) AACAAGCAACT(C)GTAAAAG-CAAACC; mutL294-F (position +896) GCTGGATTT(T)ATAAGGAT-GAGTGG and mutL294-R (position +872) CCACTCATCCTTAT(A) GAATG(G) AAATCCAGC; mutE302G-F (position +899) GATTGCCGGTGCTTTG and mutE302G-R (position +921) CAAAG-CACCGGCAATC(C)CATTC. The wild-type and mutated FRI-Bil-7 PCR fragments were introduced into pENTR201 and subsequently pGWB404 binary vector. The alleles were named FRI-Bil-7-GFP, FRI-L276R-GFP, FRI-L294F-GFP, and FRI-E302G-GFP respectively.

Inserts in all final constructs were sequenced and verified by comparison with the expected *in silico* constructs. Subsequently, all constructs were transformed into *Agrobacterium tumefaciens* strain GV3101 by electroporation. Agrobacteria transformed with pBinDsRed were selected on solid yeast extract protein (YEP) medium containing 50 mg/L kanamycin, 25 mg/L rifampicin and 50 mg/L gentamicin, whereas agrobacteria transformed with pGWB404 were selected on 100 mg/L spectinomycin, 25 mg/L rifampicin and 50 mg/L gentamicin. Positive colonies were confirmed by colony PCR and cultured in liquid YEP medium containing same antibiotics. All constructs, and an empty pBinDsRed vector used as a negative control, were transformed into Col-0 plants by the floral dip method (Clough and Bent, 1998).

Selection and phenotyping of transgenic plants

Transgenic seeds carrying pBinDsRed constructs were selected by their red fluorescence under a fluorescence stereomicroscope using monochromatic green light (wavelength *c*. 580 nm). Transgenic seeds selected in this way were directly sown in soil at the greenhouse under long day conditions for flowering time measurement. Transgenic plants carrying pGWB404 constructs were selected on Murashige and Skoog (MS) agar containing 50 mg/L kanamycin. Surviving T_1 plants were transferred to soil and grown under long day condition in the greenhouse for flowering time measurement. As a control, Col-0 seedlings were grown on MS agar without antibiotics and transferred to soil together with the transgenic plants.

Flowering time in all experiments was recorded as the number of days between seed sowing and flowering, and the number of rosette leaves and cauline leaves on the day when the first flower opened. The ratio between rosette and cauline leaves did not show any variation between the different genotypes in our experiment, so only the total leaf number was used. We found a high correlation between total leaf number and days to the opening of the first flower (Figure S9), but differences between genotypes were larger when using leaf number. Consequently, only total leaf number is reported as a measurement of flowering time. Flowering time measurements in the experiment with all T₁ transgenic plants containing different *FRI* alleles were terminated at end of the 8th week. All plants not flowering at that time were assigned with the highest recorded total leaf number in the experiment.

Expression analysis using quantitative real-time PCR

For expression analysis, stratified seeds were sown on pre-soaked soil and grown in a growth chamber in long day conditions for 10 days. Seedlings (leaves plus shoot) were harvested and immediately frozen in liquid nitrogen. Material from 8 to 10 seedlings was pooled for each one of the three biological replicates. Total RNA was extracted using RNeasy Plant Mini Kit (QIAGEN). Contaminating DNA was removed by treatment with TURBO DNA-free[™] Kit (Ambion, http://www.thermofisher.com). cDNA was synthesized from 5 µg RNA using SuperScript® II Reverse Transcriptase in a 20 µl system (Invitrogen, http://www.thermofisher.com). Quantitative RT-PCR was performed on a CFX384 Touch[™] Real-Time PCR Detection System using SYBR Green dye (iQ SYBR® Green Supermix; Bio-Rad, http://www.bio-rad.com) using the following primers: FRI f - TGCCTGATCGTGGTAAAGGGAAG, FRI r - GCA CCGGCAATCTCATTCGAAC; FLC_f - CCGAACTCATGTTGAAG CTTGTTGAG, FLC_r - CGGAGATTTGTCCAGCAGGTG; PP2A_f -TAACGTGGCCAAAATGATGC, PP2A r - GTTCTCCACAACCGC TTGGT. The expression of FRI and FLC was normalized to the expression of PP2A and subjected to further statistical analysis.

Microscopic imaging

Transgenic seeds carrying GFP constructs were sterilized and sown on MS agarose medium and grown vertically under long days for 7 days. At this time, whole seedlings were dipped in a solution of propidium iodide (10 mg/ml) for 1 min and rinsed in water. Root tips were cut off and mounted for visualization under confocal microscope (ZEISS LSM800, http://www.zeiss.com). The GFP signal was visualized under 488 nm light and the propidium iodide (PI) signal was visualized under 514 nm light. The merged image of both GFP and PI signals are presented.

Western blot assay

Transgenic seeds carrying GFP constructs were sterilized and sown on MS agarose medium and grown under long days for 7 days. Whole seedlings were pooled and pulverized in liquid nitrogen. Total protein was extracted using protein extraction buffer (PEB; Agrisera Antibodies, http://www.agrisera.com) according to the manufacturer's instructions. The protein solution was adjusted to equal concentration and separated on a NuPAGE[™] 4–12% Bis–Tris Protein Gel (Thermo Fisher Scientific, http://www.thermofisher.

Functional analysis of FRIGIDA natural variation 163

com). Each sample was loaded twice on the gel allowing separation of the gel in two parts with identical samples. One part of the gel was subjected to Coomassie staining and the other was used for blotting. Anti-GFP and secondary antibodies (Roche, http://www.roc he.com) were used according to the manufacturer's protocol. Detection was carried out using the Amersham ECL Prime Western Blotting Detection Reagent (GE Healthcare, http://www.gehealthcare. com) following the manufacturer's protocol and band intensity was analyzed with IMAGEJ software.

FRIGIDA sequences from different species

FRI protein sequences were downloaded from GenBank. The species used and their GenBank IDs are: Arabidopsis thaliana (P0DH90.1), Boechera stricta (AFJ66199.1), Arabidopsis lyrata (ABY51730.1), Tarenaya hassleriana (XP_010531851.1), Capsella rubella (AFJ66217.1), Vitis vinifera (XP_002283789.1), Brassica rapa (NP_001289004.1), Medicago truncatula (XP_003602718.2), Camelina sativa (XP_010426308.1), Nelumbo nucifera (XP_010250405.1), Arabis alpina (KFK36753.1). FRI DNA sequences were obtained from the cloned products. All alignment was performed by CLUSTAL OMEGA on the EMBL-EBI website.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

We thank U. Tartler for invaluable technical assistance. We thank M Koornneef and I. Schmalenbach for helpful comments and discussion. We thank M. Pohe and A. Lautscham for assistance with plant material. We thank G. Coupland for hosting LZ in his laboratory and providing support and supervision. LZ was funded by an International Max Planck Research School PhD fellowship. JMJ-G received funding from ANR projects (ANR-17-ERC2-0013-01, ANR-18-CE92-0039-01 and ANR-17-CE20-0024-02). IJPB benefits from the support of Saclay Plant Sciences-SPS (ANR-17-EUR-0007).

CONFLICTS OF INTEREST STATEMENT

The authors declare that they have no competing interests to disclose.

AUTHOR CONTRIBUTIONS

LZ and JMJ-G conceived the research, designed the experiments, analyzed the data, and wrote the manuscript. LZ performed all experiments.

DATA AVAILABILITY STATEMENT

Sequence data used in this manuscript are available at the Short Read Archive, under project SRP056687. All other relevant data can be found within the manuscript and its supporting materials.

SUPPORTING INFORMATION

Additional Supporting Information may be found in the online version of this article.

Figure S1. Cumulative (a) and non-cumulative (b) index of indels, synonymous SNPs and non-synonymous SNPs for all pairwise comparisons between all 103 FRI alleles (Figure S2). A representation of the canonical FRI protein is depicted in the x-axis, with coiled coil domains highlighted in yellow and the central conserved region highlighted in blue.

Figure S2. Allelic diversity at the FRI locus in Arabidopsis. (a) Maximum likelihood tree for 103 FRI alleles present in the 1135

© 2020 The Authors. *The Plant Journal* published by Society for Experimental Biology and John Wiley & Sons Ltd, *The Plant Journal*, (2020), **103**, 154–165

164 Lei Zhang and José M. Jiménez-Gómez

re-sequenced. The H51 allele (a001) was used as root. Asterisks in the names indicate alleles functionally characterized in this work. (b) Graphical representation of sequence differences between each allele and the H51 allele. Background colour represents putatively functional (grey) and non-functional (red) alleles. Black open circles represent non-synonymous SNPs. Rectangles and triangles represent deletions and insertions, respectively, and the numbers inside indicate their length in bp. Blue symbols indicate non-frameshift indels. Red symbols indicate frameshift indels or stop codon gain/losses, all of which are considered to putatively disrupt the function of the protein. (c) Number of accessions (in \log_2 scale) carrying each allele. The dotted line indicates the threshold of 2. Putatively non-functional alleles are coloured in red. (d) Average flowering time \pm standard error of the mean of all accessions carrying each allele. Putatively non-functional alleles are indicated in red.

Figure S3. Percentage of putatively functional/non-functional FRI alleles in each of the 10 STRUCTURE population groups. The frequency across all accessions analyzed is shown on the leftmost bar. Divergence from this frequency was calculated using a two-sided Fisher's test (*P < 0.05, **P < 0.01)

Figure S4. Flowering time of 1016 Arabidopsis accessions classified by the putative functionality of their FRI allele. Flowering time data were obtained from the 1001 genome's project from plants grown in long days at 16°C; and functionality of the FRI allele is as indicated in Table S3.

Figure S5. Graphical representation of polymorphisms found in the FRI alleles cloned and sequenced. All sequences are compared with the fully functional allele in the Bil-7 accession. Light blue blocks represent exons, black tick marks represent SNPs, and red blocks represent deletions.

Figure S6. Sequence alignment of FRI conserved central domain. Alignment of FRI protein sequences from species in the Brassicaceae family (in black) and outside (in grey). Positions 276 and 302 are, respectively, mutated to R and G in FRI-Bå1-2 and are coloured in blue. Position 294 is mutated to F in FRI-Wa-1 and is coloured in red. Alignment was produced with Clustal Omega.

Figure S7. Relative position of L276R amino acid substitution and the predicted nuclear localization signals (NLS) on FRI protein.

Figure S8. Geographical distribution of accessions carrying the L276R (a089) and L294F (a016) mutations. The location of the accession as indicated in the 1001 genome's project is represented with dots in the map. The location for accession Litva, for which no location was available, was set to the capital of Lithuania. Genetic components for each accession are represented in the pie charts.

Figure S9. Correlation between flowering time measured as total leaf number and days to opening of the first flower. Data presented are from the transgenic lines in Figure 3. Differences between lines were greater and less variable when using total leaf number, so this trait was used in all our experiments.

 Table S1. Variants found in the FRI locus.

Table S2. Variant comparison with previous works.

Table S3. Allele id and flowering time for each accession.

Data S1. DNA sequences of all FRI alleles cloned in this work.

 $\ensuremath{\text{Data}}$ S2. ClustalW alignment of FRI alleles cloned and sequenced in this work.

REFERENCES

- Amasino, R. (2010) Seasonal and developmental timing of flowering. Plant J. Cell Mol. Biol. 61, 1001–1013.
- Angel, A., Song, J., Dean, C. and Howard, M. (2011) A Polycomb-based switch underlying quantitative epigenetic memory. *Nature*, 476, 105–108.

- Bankevich, A., Nurk, S., Antipov, D. et al. (2012) SPAdes: a new genome assembly algorithm and its applications to single-cell sequencing. J. Comput. Biol. 19, 455–477.
- Bloomer, R.H. and Dean, C. (2017) Fine-tuning timing: natural variation informs the mechanistic basis of the switch to flowering in *Arabidopsis thaliana. J. Exp. Bot.* 68, 5439–5452.
- Burn, J.E., Smyth, D.R., Peacock, W.J. and Dennis, E.S. (1993) Genes conferring late flowering in Arabidopsis thaliana. Genetica, 90, 147–155.
- Caicedo, A.L., Stinchcombe, J.R., Olsen, K.M., Schmitt, J. and Purugganan, M.D. (2004) Epistatic interaction between Arabidopsis FRI and FLC flowering time genes generates a latitudinal cline in a life history trait. *Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA*, **101**, 15670–15675.
- Camacho, C., Coulouris, G., Avagyan, V., Ma, N., Papadopoulos, J., Bealer, K. and Madden, T.L. (2009) BLAST+: architecture and applications. *BMC Bioinformatics*, **10**, 421.
- Choi, J., Hyun, Y., Kang, M.-J. et al. (2009) Resetting and regulation of Flowering Locus C expression during Arabidopsis reproductive development. *Plant J. Cell Mol. Biol.* 57, 918–931.
- Choi, K., Kim, J., Hwang, H.-J., Kim, S., Park, C., Kim, S.Y. and Lee, I. (2011) The FRIGIDA complex activates transcription of FLC, a strong flowering repressor in Arabidopsis, by recruiting chromatin modification factors. *Plant Cell*, 23, 289–303.
- Clarke, J.H. and Dean, C. (1994) Mapping FRI, a locus controlling flowering time and vernalization response in Arabidopsis thaliana. Mol. Gen. Genet. MGG, 242, 81–89.
- Clough, S.J. and Bent, A.F. (1998) Floral dip: a simplified method for Agrobacterium-mediated transformation of *Arabidopsis thaliana*. *Plant J. Cell Mol. Biol.* 16, 735–743.
- Danecek, P., Auton, A., Abecasis, G. et al. (2011) The variant call format and VCFtools. Bioinforma. Oxf. Engl. 27, 2156–2158.
- De Lucia, F., Crevillen, P., Jones, A.M.E., Greb, T. and Dean, C. (2008) A PHD-polycomb repressive complex 2 triggers the epigenetic silencing of FLC during vernalization. *Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA*, **105**, 16831–16836.
- Edgar, R.C. (2004) MUSCLE: multiple sequence alignment with high accuracy and high throughput. Nucleic Acids Res. 32, 1792–1797.
- Gazzani, S., Gendall, A.R., Lister, C. and Dean, C. (2003) Analysis of the molecular basis of flowering time variation in Arabidopsis accessions. *Plant Physiol.* **132**, 1107–1114.
- Genomes Consortium (2016) 1,135 genomes reveal the global pattern of polymorphism in Arabidopsis thaliana. Cell, 166, 481–491.
- Hagenblad, J., Tang, C., Molitor, J., Werner, J., Zhao, K., Zheng, H., Marjoram, P., Weigel, D. and Nordborg, M. (2004) Haplotype structure and phenotypic associations in the chromosomal regions surrounding two *Arabidopsis thaliana* flowering time loci. *Genetics*, 168, 1627–1638.
- Heo, J.B. and Sung, S. (2011) Encoding memory of winter by noncoding RNAs. *Epigenetics*, 6, 544–547.
- Ho, S.N., Hunt, H.D., Horton, R.M., Pullen, J.K. and Pease, L.R. (1989) Sitedirected mutagenesis by overlap extension using the polymerase chain reaction. *Gene*, 77, 51–59.
- Hu, X., Kong, X., Wang, C. et al. (2014) Proteasome-mediated degradation of FRIGIDA modulates flowering time in Arabidopsis during vernalization. Plant Cell, 26, 4763–4781.
- Hyun, K., Oh, J.E., Park, J., Noh, Y.-S. and Song, J.-J. (2016) Structural analysis of FRIGIDA flowering-time regulator. *Mol. Plant*, 9, 618–620.
- Johanson, U., West, J., Lister, C., Michaels, S., Amasino, R. and Dean, C. (2000) Molecular analysis of FRIGIDA, a major determinant of natural variation in Arabidopsis flowering time. *Science*, 290, 344–347.
- Kim, S., Choi, K., Park, C., Hwang, H.-J. and Lee, I. (2006) SUPPRESSOR OF FRIGIDA4, encoding a C2H2-Type zinc finger protein, represses flowering by transcriptional activation of Arabidopsis FLOWERING LOCUS C. *Plant Cell*, 18, 2985–2998.
- King, B.R. and Guda, C. (2007) ngLOC: an n-gram-based Bayesian method for estimating the subcellular proteomes of eukaryotes. *Genome Biol.* 8, R68.
- Koornneef, M., Alonso-Blanco, C. and Vreugdenhil, D. (2004) Naturally occurring genetic variation in Arabidopsis thaliana. Annu. Rev. Plant Biol. 55, 141–172.
- Langmead, B. and Salzberg, S.L. (2012) Fast gapped-read alignment with Bowtie 2. Nat. Methods, 9, 357–359.
- Le Corre, V. (2005) Variation at two flowering time genes within and among populations of *Arabidopsis thaliana*: comparison with markers and traits. *Mol. Ecol.* 14, 4181–4192.

- Le Corre, V., Roux, F. and Reboud, X. (2002) DNA polymorphism at the FRI-GIDA gene in Arabidopsis thaliana: extensive nonsynonymous variation is consistent with local selection for flowering time. Mol. Biol. Evol. 19, 1261–1271.
- Lee, I., Bleecker, A. and Amasino, R. (1993) Analysis of naturally occurring late flowering in Arabidopsis thaliana. Mol. Gen. Genet. MGG, 237, 171– 176.
- Lempe, J., Balasubramanian, S., Sureshkumar, S., Singh, A., Schmid, M. and Weigel, D. (2005) Diversity of flowering responses in wild *Arabidopsis thaliana* strains. *PLoS Genet.* 1, 109–118.
- Li, H., Handsaker, B., Wysoker, A. et al. (2009) The Sequence Alignment/ Map format and SAMtools. Bioinforma. Oxf. Engl. 25, 2078–2079.
- Li, P., Filiault, D., Box, M.S. et al. (2014) Multiple FLC haplotypes defined by independent cis-regulatory variation underpin life history diversity in Arabidopsis thaliana. Genes Dev. 28, 1635–1640.
- Li, Z., Jiang, D. and He, Y. (2018) FRIGIDA establishes a local chromosomal environment for FLOWERING LOCUS C mRNA production. *Nat. Plants*, 4, 836–846.
- McKenna, A., Hanna, M., Banks, E. et al. (2010) The genome analysis Toolkit: a MapReduce framework for analyzing next-generation DNA sequencing data. Genome Res. 20, 1297–1303.
- Méndez-Vigo, B., Picó, F.X., Ramiro, M., Martínez-Zapater, J.M. and Alonso-Blanco, C. (2011) Altitudinal and climatic adaptation is mediated by flowering traits and FRI, FLC, and PHYC genes in Arabidopsis. *Plant Physiol.* 157, 1942–1955.
- Michaels, S.D. and Amasino, R.M. (1999) FLOWERING LOCUS C encodes a novel MADS domain protein that acts as a repressor of flowering. *Plant Cell*, 11, 949–956.
- Nair, R., Carter, P. and Rost, B. (2003) NLSdb: database of nuclear localization signals. *Nucleic Acids Res.* 31, 397–399.
- Nakagawa, T., Suzuki, T., Murata, S. et al. (2007) Improved Gateway binary vectors: high-performance vectors for creation of fusion constructs in transgenic analysis of plants. *Biosci. Biotechnol. Biochem.* 71, 2095– 2100.
- Pigliucci, M., Pollard, H. and Cruzan, M.B. (2003) Comparative studies of evolutionary responses to light environments in Arabidopsis. Am. Nat. 161, 68–82.

Functional analysis of FRIGIDA natural variation 165

- Risk, J.M., Laurie, R.E., Macknight, R.C. and Day, C.L. (2010) FRIGIDA and related proteins have a conserved central domain and family specific Nand C- terminal regions that are functionally important. *Plant Mol. Biol.* 73, 493–505.
- Robinson, J.T., Thorvaldsdóttir, H., Winckler, W., Guttman, M., Lander, E.S., Getz, G. and Mesirov, J.P. (2011) Integrative genomics viewer. *Nat. Biotechnol.* 29, 24–26.
- Schmalenbach, I., Zhang, L., Ryngajllo, M. and Jiménez-Gómez, J.M. (2014) Functional analysis of the *Landsberg erecta* allele of FRIGIDA. *BMC Plant Biol.* 14, 218.
- Sheldon, C.C., Hills, M.J., Lister, C., Dean, C., Dennis, E.S. and Peacock, W.J. (2008) Resetting of FLOWERING LOCUS C expression after epigenetic repression by vernalization. *Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA*, 105, 2214– 2219.
- Shindo, C., Aranzana, M.J., Lister, C., Baxter, C., Nicholls, C., Nordborg, M. and Dean, C. (2005) Role of FRIGIDA and FLOWERING LOCUS C in determining variation in flowering time of Arabidopsis. *Plant Physiol.* 138, 1163–1173.
- Sperschneider, J., Catanzariti, A.-M., DeBoer, K., Petre, B., Gardiner, D.M., Singh, K.B., Dodds, P.N. and Taylor, J.M. (2017) LOCALIZER: subcellular localization prediction of both plant and effector proteins in the plant cell. *Sci. Rep.* 7, 44598.
- Stinchcombe, J.R., Weinig, C., Ungerer, M., Olsen, K.M., Mays, C., Halldorsdottir, S.S., Purugganan, M.D. and Schmitt, J. (2004) A latitudinal cline in flowering time in Arabidopsis thaliana modulated by the flowering time gene FRIGIDA. Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA, 101, 4712–4717.
- Toomajian, C., Hu, T.T., Aranzana, M.J. et al. (2006) A nonparametric test reveals selection for rapid flowering in the Arabidopsis genome. PLoS Biol. 4, e137.
- Wang, K., Li, M. and Hakonarson, H. (2010) ANNOVAR: functional annotation of genetic variants from high-throughput sequencing data. *Nucleic Acids Res.* 38, e164.
- Werner, J.D., Borevitz, J.O., Uhlenhaut, N.H., Ecker, J.R., Chory, J. and Weigel, D. (2005) FRIGIDA-independent variation in flowering time of natural *Arabidopsis thaliana* accessions. *Genetics*, **170**, 1197–1207.